FROM MSCI ESG RESEARCH INC.

MSCI ESG THOUGHT <u>LEADERS</u> COUNCIL

CORPORATE GOVERNANCE FUNDAMENTALS | MARCH 2016

INTRODUCTION TO THE MSCI ESG THOUGHT LEADER COUNCIL

The goal of the MSCI ESG Research Thought Leaders Council is to maintain our leading edge in research methodology by regularly seeking feedback and opinions from external experts in key industries and relevant ESG issue areas. The MSCI ESG Research Thought Leaders Council consists of a series of about three to four panels annually, with three to seven members on each panel. We aim to assemble international experts with recognized leadership and expertise on the topic area related to the panel.

The eighth council on Corporate Governance Fundamentals, the first in a series of panels on corporate governance themes, was held on March 29, 2016. Panel members were asked to review MSCI ESG Research's proprietary GovernanceMetrics Ratings methodology, as well as specific company and thematic reports before participating in the official panel call with MSCI ESG Research. The following key takeaways and discussion points represent a synopsis/summary of the discussions and do not represent a transcript.

KEY TAKEAWAYS

- The panel agreed that while some governance standards are universal the need for independent board members for example a proper governance assessment has to incorporate market specifics.

 Besides comparing governance in one jurisdiction to another, investors want to be able to compare companies within the same industry across borders. One challenge is that disclosure is a key driver of cross-border governance assessments, and companies are automatically disadvantaged if they operate in a regime with poor disclosure requirements. Even companies that want to disclose more can't get too far ahead of their regulators.
- Accounting integrity is becoming an increasingly important aspect of governance. Still, while governance assessments should include high-level indicators of accounting integrity, which should be clearly supported by factual data, highly technical forensic accounting assessments should be presented separately.
- In addition to current governance practices, investors are increasingly focusing on trends / momentum / trajectory. How have governance risks at a particular company changed over time? What specific factors have changed, and when did those changes occur?

- Governance quality matters as much to fixed income investors as equity investors – perhaps even more as fixed income investors don't have voting rights.
 However, while issues like proper capital allocation matter to all asset classes, there may be certain governance issues where fixed income and equity investors have a different point of view – for example, shareholder rights.
- The panel agreed that corporate culture is a critical concern, though often difficult to assess, and seems to have played a key role in recent corporate scandals like Petrobras, VW and Valeant. One possible avenue of research is to look at whistleblower policies and controls. The panel also referred to the ICGN's "Corporate Culture Indicators" as a helpful quide.
- Other issues the panel agreed were critical included
 a "laser-like focus" on board skills and composition,
 a growing awareness of the need for diversity at both
 the board and company level, and CEO succession
 planning. Assessing the differences in how hybrid
 instruments are issued was also discussed as an area
 of growing interest, particularly in Europe.



PANELISTS



Bess Joffe



Marina Brogi University of Rome



Dr Stephen M. Davis Harvard Law School



Dr Marcel Jeucken PGGM



Matthew Orsagh CFA Institute



Paul Schneider



Dr Daniel Summerfield USS

ABOUT MSCI ESG RESEARCH PRODUCTS AND SERVICES

MSCI's ESG products and services are provided by MSCI ESG Research Inc. and are designed to provide in-depth research, ratings and analysis of environmental, social and governance-related business practices to companies worldwide. ESG ratings, data and analysis from MSCI ESG Research are also used in the construction of the MSCI ESG Indexes. MSCI ESG Research is produced by MSCI's indirect wholly-owned subsidiary MSCI ESG Research Inc., a Registered Investment Adviser under the Investment Advisers Act of 1940.

ABOUT MSCI

For more than 40 years, MSCI's research-based indexes and analytics have helped the world's leading investors build and manage better portfolios. Clients rely on our offerings for deeper insights into the drivers of performance and risk in their portfolios, broad asset class coverage and innovative research. Our line of products and services includes indexes, analytical models, data, real estate benchmarks and ESG research. MSCI serves 97 of the top 100 largest money managers, according to the most recent P&I ranking. For more information, visit us at www.msci.com.

The information contained herein (the "Information") may not be reproduced or redisseminated in whole or in part without prior written permission from MSCI. The Information may not be used to verify or correct other data, to create indexes, risk models, or analytics, or in connection with issuing, offering, sponsoring, managing or marketing any securities, portfolios, financial products or other investment vehicles. Historical data and analysis should not be taken as an indication or guarantee of any future performance, analysis, forecast or prediction. None of the Information or MSCI index or other product or service constitutes an offer to buy or sell, or a promotion or recommendation of, any security, financial instrument or product or trading strategy. Further, none of the Information or any MSCI index is intended to constitute investment advice or a recommendation to make (or refrain from making) any kind of investment decision and may not be relied on as such. The Information is provided "as is" and the user of the Information assumes the entire risk of any use it may make or permit to be made of the Information. NONE OF MSCI INC. OR ANY OF ITS SUBSIDIARIES OR ITS OR THEIR DIRECT OR INDIRECT SUPPLIERS OR ANY THIRD PARTY INVOLVED IN THE MAKING OR COMPILING OF THE INFORMATION (EACH, AN "MSCI PARTY") MAKES ANY WARRANTIES OR REPRESENTATIONS AND, TO THE MAXIMUM EXTENT PERMITTED BY LAW, EACH MSCI PARTY HEREBY EXPRESSLY DISCLAIMS ALL IMPLIED WARRANTIES, INCLUDING WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY AND FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE. WITHOUT LIMITING ANY OF THE FOREGOING AND TO THE MAXIMUM EXTENT PERMITTED BY LAW, IN NO EVENT SHALL ANY OF THE FOREGOING FOR INSTITUTE, INCLUDING LOST PROFITS) OR ANY OTHER DAMAGES EVEN IF NOTIFIED OF THE POSSIBILITY OF SUCH DAMAGES. The foregoing shall not exclude or limit any liability that may not by applicable law be excluded or limited.

©2016 MSCI Inc. All rights reserved | CIN0516

